Concurrent Enrollment:
No Match, No Money

Elizabeth Conder, USHE

Kristin Campbell, USBE

USHE Data Quality Summit
August 3, 2018
Concurrent Enrollment: A USHE and USBE Partnership

- Utah is one of a handful of states in the U.S. where the state provides some reimbursement funds for the tuition high school students pay to take college courses through an appropriation (GA, ID, IL, IN, ME, MN, UT)

- In the early 1990’s the Utah legislature provided state funding for concurrent enrollment and it continues through the Minimum School Program

- Funds are provided to USBE and USBE distributes funds based on the number of credit hours successfully completed by students in the prior year

- In 2016-2017 high school students saved over $41 million in tuition by taking concurrent enrollment classes
## Funding History

### Annual Legislative Appropriation for Concurrent Enrollment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Ongoing</th>
<th>One-Time</th>
<th>Supplemental</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995-96</td>
<td>$2,044,856</td>
<td></td>
<td>$400,000</td>
<td>$2,444,856</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-97</td>
<td>$2,554,591</td>
<td>$207,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$2,761,591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-98</td>
<td>$3,494,241</td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,450,800</td>
<td>$4,945,041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999-00</td>
<td>$4,701,173</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$4,701,173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-01</td>
<td>$4,960,838</td>
<td></td>
<td>$650,000</td>
<td>$5,610,838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-02</td>
<td>$6,149,390</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$6,149,390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-03</td>
<td>$5,310,029</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$5,310,029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-04</td>
<td>$5,354,633</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$5,354,633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-05</td>
<td>$5,354,633</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$5,354,633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-06</td>
<td>$5,541,959</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$5,541,959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
<td>$8,292,311</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,292,311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-08</td>
<td>$9,215,497</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$9,215,497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-09</td>
<td>$8,705,286</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,705,286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-10</td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,531,186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>$8,893,300</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$8,893,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>$9,270,600</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$9,270,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>$9,766,700</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$9,766,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>$10,209,200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$10,209,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>$10,784,300</td>
<td>$527,012</td>
<td></td>
<td>$11,311,312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>$11,184,400</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$11,184,400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- CE appropriation is tied to the WPU (weighted pupil unit) and grows each year
- FY17 appropriation of $10,784,300 was supplemented with $527,012 SB 196 funds in support of unusually high increase in CE Math earned credit.
## CE Student Enrollments by USHE Institution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>15-16*</th>
<th>16-17*</th>
<th>Net Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Utah</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah State University/USU Eastern</td>
<td>3,648</td>
<td>3,886</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weber State University</td>
<td>9,214</td>
<td>10,180</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Utah University</td>
<td>827</td>
<td>849</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snow College</td>
<td>1,522</td>
<td>1,802</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>1,377</td>
<td>1,654</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah Valley University</td>
<td>7,729</td>
<td>8,706</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salt Lake Community College</td>
<td>7,476</td>
<td>8,020</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>31,899</strong></td>
<td><strong>35,254</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,354</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Distinct</strong></td>
<td><strong>29,758</strong></td>
<td><strong>32,849</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,091</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Distinct headcount by institution; students who took classes from multiple institutions are listed under each institution.*
35.9% of public high school juniors and seniors participated in CE in 2016-17
Of the June 2017 high school graduating class, 50% of the students had taken at least one CE course
The Matching Process:

*Identifying concurrent enrollment student records*

1. In July, USHE pulls end of term data from most recently ended academic year

From Student Courses File: **SC_STUDENT_TYPE of “CC”**
- CC indicates student is a Utah concurrent enrollment student enrolled in college courses for dual high school and college credit who continues to be enrolled as a high school student and counted in Average Daily Membership of a public resident high school

From Courses File: **C_BUDGET CODE of “BC” or “SF”**
- BC = Budget-Related Concurrent Enrollment indicating that the USHE institution bore the cost of instruction meaning that the course was taught by a USHE faculty member
- SF = Self-Supporting Concurrent Enrollment indicating that the district bore the cost of instruction meaning that the course was taught in the high school by a high school teacher adjunct
The Matching Process: 

*The importance of C_BUDGET_CODE*

Correct budget code assignment for each concurrent enrollment course is critical because:

Budget Code of BC signals that USHE will receive **60%** of the per credit appropriation

Budget Code of SF signals that USHE will receive **40%** of the per credit appropriation

Courses with a budget code of anything other than BC or SF receive **0%** of the concurrent enrollment appropriation
The Matching Process

Review of critical data elements in preparation for USBE match

2. Additional elements from each concurrent enrollment student record are reviewed:
   • Birth dates are checked for students to be within reasonable age range for high school (10-20 years of age)
   • High School Codes from the Student file submission should be for a Utah public high school and should not be:
     • an unknown high school (ACT code 459200)
     • an out-of-country high school (ACT code 459150)
     • an out-of-state high school (ACT code 459100)
     • a GED (ACT code 459300)
     • home schooling (ACT code 459500)
   • S_SSID (ID issued to student by USBE) from the Student file submission should not be blank
   • Duplicate enrollments are checked and removed
The Matching Process

Review of critical data elements in preparation for USBE match cont’d

• Each enrollment record must contain a course that appears on the Concurrent Enrollment Master List:
  • From the Courses file submission course prefix and course number must match to an 11-digit high school core code that appears on the current year’s Concurrent Enrollment Master List
  • Concurrent Enrollment Master List is available online: UtahCE.org

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Prefix</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Core Code</th>
<th>Core Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>ACCT</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
<td>Applied Business Accounting</td>
<td>2030013030</td>
<td>Accounting I CE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>ACCT</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>Financial Accounting</td>
<td>2030013020</td>
<td>Accounting II CE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>ART</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
<td>Intro to Art</td>
<td>0201003030</td>
<td>Art History CE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>ASL</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
<td>Beginning American Sign Language</td>
<td>0301003002</td>
<td>ASL - CE 1020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University</td>
<td>BIOL</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
<td>General Biology</td>
<td>0802003020</td>
<td>Biology with Lab CE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Student must have a valid grade in each course taken (i.e. grades of I, IP, AU, blank/missing are not valid)
The Matching Process

**USBE Match**

3. USHE sends data file to USBE

4. USBE completes student match in UTREX by either using:
   - SSID as provided by the USHE institution OR
   - Student’s last name, first name, birthdate and gender

5. USBE completes full match with the high school transcript by validating that the student is:
   - Enrolled at the high school as reported by the USHE institution
   - Enrolled in the course as reported by the USHE institution (using the high school core code from the CE Master List)

6. USBE and USHE work together to match as many enrollment records as possible...this can take months...

7. A final enrollment list is agreed upon by both systems
CE: The Funding Formula

Once the data matching process is complete, the CE funding appropriation is split between the systems. The formula looks at the proportion of earned credits where a USHE faculty member instructed (BC, 60%) and the proportion of earned credits where a high school teacher adjunct instructed (SF, 40%)

1. # of Earned Credits with BC
   Budget Code
   Total Credits Earned

2. Multiplied by 60%

3. Multiplied by the total amount of the concurrent enrollment appropriation

4. Equals USHE BC funding

1. # of Earned Credits with SF
   Budget Code
   Total Credits Earned

2. Multiplied by 40%

3. Multiplied by the total amount of the concurrent enrollment appropriation

4. Equals USHE SF funding

USHE BC funding + USHE SF funding = Total CE Appropriation for USHE
CE: The Funding Formula

- In 2016-2017, 233,625.50 concurrent enrollments credits were earned:
  - 38,534.5 credits led by USHE faculty (BC budget code) – 60% funding
  - 195,091 credits led by high school teacher adjuncts (SF budget code) – 40% funding

- $11,311,312 concurrent enrollment appropriation:
  - USHE portion of appropriation: $4,897,665
  - USBE portion of appropriation: $6,413,647

Math:
(38,534.50 BC credits/233,625.50 total credits) x 60% funding x $11,311,312 appropriation = $1,119,422

(195,091 SF credits/233,625.50 total credits) x 40% funding x $11,311,312 appropriation = $3,778,243

$1,119,422 + $3,778,243 = $4,897,665 Total USHE Portion
Once USHE has received a check from USBE, the USHE portion of the appropriation is divided among the institutions:

- Two rates are calculated for CE credits earned where:
  - 80% is proportioned for credits led by USHE faculty (BC)
  - 20% is proportioned for credits led by high school teacher adjuncts (SF)

- In 2016-17:
  - $56.10 was distributed to institutions per credit led by USHE faculty
  - $14.02 was distributed to institutions per credit led by high school teacher adjunct
Troubleshooting the Data Match

A correct SSID is the key to the matching process between USHE and USBE

- Last year 30%+ of CE students were missing SSID in the data sent by institutions

Other Data Match Challenges:

- Missing or incorrect high school
- Missing/invalid final grade in CE course (grades of AU, I, IP are not valid)
- Typos in SSID, student name, date of birth, gender
- Course coding that deviates from how course appears on the CE Master List
- Duplicate enrollments

USU, U of U, and SUU are using the concurrent enrollment participation form which matches the student to the USBE database on the front-end and eliminates the possibility of SSID mismatch.
Student Matches when SSID is not required

- In 2017-18, almost 6,000 students did not send in SSIDs with their enrollments
  - 20% of these did not match a SSID when first name, last name, date of birth and gender were matched
  - The institutions were sent back these students to contact their high schools to get the information

- Of the 21,000 new students who enrolled in 2017-18 with an SSID either through the participation form or provided during registration, only 2 had incorrect SSIDs.
What Can be Done?

1. Use the concurrent enrollment participation form
2. Error checks put in place by USHE on data submission files can be mirrored on campus
3. Fix data errors at midyear when the midyear report is distributed
4. Check for missing CE grades BEFORE grade update file is due to USHE in July